

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

CASE NO. 11-60702-CIV-COOKE/TURNOFF

SECURITIES AND EXCHANGE COMMISSION,

Plaintiff,

v.

COMMODITIES ONLINE, LLC, and
COMMODITIES ONLINE MANAGEMENT,

Defendants.

RECEIVER'S ELEVENTH STATUS REPORT

David S. Mandel, the Court-appointed Receiver of Commodities Online LLC and Commodities Online Management, LLC (together, "Commodities Online" or the Defendants), files this Eleventh Status Report to inform the Court and the investors and creditors of the Receivership's activities to date.¹

I. PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND

On April 1, 2011, the United States Securities and Exchange Commission (the "SEC") filed a civil complaint in this matter, charging Commodities Online with violating federal securities laws by "duping investors into funding a fraudulent scheme and violating the antifraud and registration provisions of the federal securities laws." [D.E. 1]. On the same day, on the SEC's motion, the Court entered the Order Appointing Receiver that appointed David S. Mandel as Receiver over the Defendants (the "Receivership Order"). [D.E. 3 & 5].

¹ The Receiver's previous status reports may be found at D.E. 11, 22, 116, 159, 197, 221, 232, 246, 260 and 274.

II. THE RECEIVER'S ROLE AND RESPONSIBILITIES

Upon his appointment, the Receiver took immediate possession and control over the offices and business locations of the Defendants, and promptly began to marshal the Defendants' assets to protect investors' and creditors' interests. The Receiver also commenced an inquiry into the business affairs and the financial condition of the Defendants. Pursuant to the authority granted in the Receivership Order, the Receiver retained certain professionals to search, recover and protect the Defendants' corporate assets, and to otherwise untangle the Defendants' financial and operational affairs. During the period since the Receiver's last status report filed April 16, 2013 [D.E. 246], the following professionals have provided essential services to the Receiver (1) the law firm of Mandel & Mandel LLP; (2) the forensic accounting firm of Kapila & Company ("Kapila"); (3) the law firm of Barclay Cale, P.A., and (4) the law firm of Kozyak, Tropin & Throckmorton, P.A., specifically regarding bankruptcy matters as discussed further below.

The Receiver established and maintains an informational website www.commoditiesonline.com dedicated to Receivership business, which is regularly updated. The Receiver also created an email address: Commodities-Receiver@mandel-law.com to correspond with victim/investors, creditors, and others relating to Receivership business. In addition, Mandel & Mandel LLP dedicated an extension on its telephone system for communications relating to the Receivership and continues to respond to inquiries from Commodities Online victim/investors and creditors.

The Receiver sets forth below the status of his activities, investigation and analysis of the assets of the Defendants to date.

A. Receivership Assets**1. Financial Assets**

Pursuant to the Court's Order Appointing the Receiver, the Receivership Order was served on several financial institutions believed to have funds on deposit belonging to the Defendants and approximately \$2.4 million was frozen in the various bank accounts of the Defendants. Subsequently, the Receiver seized these funds and placed the funds in new cash accounts established in the name of David S. Mandel, as Receiver of the Defendants, on behalf of the receivership estate. Additionally, the Receiver and his forensic accountants (detailed below) have done an extensive analysis of the funds received and disbursed by the Defendants.

The Receiver's forensic accountants' confirmed that during the period January 1, 2010, through April 1, 2011, Defendant Commodities Online, LLC ("Commodities Online") received and disbursed the following amounts:

**FUNDS RECEIVED BY COMMODITIES ONLINE
FROM JANUARY 2010 THROUGH APRIL 2011**

<u>Source of Funds</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Investors	\$18,800,778
Insiders and related parties	\$11,996,367
Equity interest holders	\$2,374,162
Subscriptions	\$920,097
Other	<u>\$1,555,800</u>
TOTAL	<u>\$35,647,204</u>

FUNDS DISBURSED BY COMMODITIES ONLINE
FROM JANUARY 2010 THROUGH APRIL 2011

<u>Recipient</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Insiders and related parties	\$20,262,172
Iron ore ²	\$7,417,987
Investors	\$3,093,569
Salaries ³	\$128,848
Legal and Professional	\$523,152
Other	<u>\$1,787,160</u>
Total	<u>\$33,212,888</u>

Based on the foregoing, during the relevant time period over 37.4% of the total aggregate funds received and over 67.5% of the total aggregate funds disbursed by Commodities Online were received from and disbursed to insiders and related parties outside of Commodities Online.

For the purpose of determining the sources of funds received and disbursed to the insiders and related parties by Commodities Online, the Receiver's forensic accountants reviewed and analyzed banking records in the form of bank statements, canceled checks, deposit tickets and wire transfer advices for the period of January 2010 through April 2011. Additionally, in order to determine the nature of the transactions of these potential targets of lawsuits, the forensic accountants prepared a reconstruction of the funds received and disbursed by insiders and related

² After appointment of the Receiver, the Receiver procured the return of \$826,185 in funds relating to iron ore, and has subtracted this amount from the total amount of "iron ore" disbursement. Note also that the Receiver has generally referred to this category as "iron ore" and not "iron ore contracts" as it is unclear whether all of these funds related to any specific iron ore contract.

³ The vast majority of funds disbursed that the Receiver originally classified as "salaries" in its Initial Status Report in the Funds Disbursed chart [*See* D.E. 11 at 7] were, in fact, not for employment services provided to the Defendants, and have been reclassified in other categories in this Revised Funds Disbursed chart. Thus, the Receiver's Revised Funds Disbursed chart for the category of "salaries" was substantially decreased from the Receiver's initial analysis.

parties on a transactional level basis (the “Insiders and Related Parties Bank Reconstruction”). The Insiders and Related Parties Bank Reconstruction was the result of the financial analysis of more than 35 accounts maintained at various financial institutions and encompassed more than 9,500 transactions.

The Receiver’s forensic accountants combined the results of the Insiders and Related Parties Bank Reconstruction with the reconstruction of the banking activity of Commodities Online. After review and analysis of the combined activity, the forensic accountants worked with the Receiver to better understand the fraudulent transactions conducted by the Defendants and the substantiation of the operations of Commodities Online. The forensic analysis is updated as the Receiver obtains additional information.

2. Defendants’ Offices - 6550 N. Federal Highway, Suite 220, Fort Lauderdale, Florida, and 1940 SE 2nd Street, Pompano Beach, Florida

The Receiver removed all files, records, documents, computers, servers, and all other identifiable assets of the Defendants in these offices, and terminated the lease obligations and preserved the assets.

3. Mexican Iron Ore

As detailed in the Receiver’s previous status reports, after substantial investigation, including extensive interviews, depositions, and on-site investigation conducted both in the United States and Mexico, the Receiver concluded that the Defendants had no recoverable iron ore or related equipment in Mexico. The Receiver does not anticipate making any further efforts to recover physical iron ore or related equipment in Mexico.

With the assistance of the Receiver’s forensic accountants, the Receiver ascertained that the Defendants may have expended over \$8 million purportedly relating to the purchase of iron ore and

related equipment. During March 2011 alone, after the Defendants were served with subpoenas from the SEC and just before the Receiver's appointment by the Court, Defendants disbursed more than \$6 million to various bank accounts titled in the names of individuals and entities purporting to relate to the purchase of iron ore and related equipment. The forensic accountants have reviewed and analyzed documents and numerous banking transactions to ascertain these amounts. To the extent that any of the funds relating to the purported purchasers of iron ore that the Defendants disbursed to these bank accounts do not prove to be legitimate business transactions, the Receiver intends to seek and claim this money on behalf of the receivership estate.

4. Attorney Retainers for Former Employees of the Defendants

Before the Receiver was appointed, Defendants transferred approximately \$77,000 to attorneys as retainers to represent employees of the Defendants at the time. The Receiver recovered more than \$22,000 in retainer fees from these attorneys.

5. Securing Computer Data and Emails

The Receiver imaged all computers of the Defendants and has preserved this information. The Receiver continues to analyze and review this information for relevance to claims on behalf of the receivership estate. The Receiver also preserved all previous email accounts of the Defendants.

B. Identification of Investor-Victims

The Receiver seized various computer databases and files from the Defendants which provided information regarding the individuals and entities who "invested" in "contracts," and/or "purchased equity shares" in Defendants, and/or purchased "subscriptions" to the Defendants' database of "contracts." Moreover, numerous individuals have contacted the Receiver by telephone and by email attempting to ascertain the status of their money. The Receiver has compiled the information from these various sources into a comprehensive spreadsheet.

C. Receiver's Actions to Recoup Investors' Funds

1. Disgorgement from James Howard

On August 23, 2011, the Court granted the Receiver's motion and ordered James C. Howard III, a former principal of Commodities Online, to disgorge \$1,450,000 that he transferred from Commodities Online to Sutton Capital, a company Howard owned and controlled. [D.E. 39; hereinafter the "Disgorgement Order"]. As detailed in the Receiver's previous status reports [D.E. 116, 159, 197], Howard resisted complying with the Disgorgement Order, including appealing to the Eleventh Circuit Court of Appeals, moving to vacate the Disgorgement Order, moving to modify the Disgorgement Order, and repeatedly failing to make payments as ordered by Court. [D.E. 64, 75, 139, 144, 195, 203, 206]. On July 20, 2012, the Court ordered Howard to make full payment in four parts beginning July 31, 2012, or face possible immediate incarceration [D.E. 206, at 8-9]. Howard again failed to pay anything on that date, and on August 1, 2012, Howard filed a petition for Chapter 7 bankruptcy. Thereafter, the Court entered a stay of the instant case as against him [D.E. 207, 211].

2. *David S. Mandel, Receiver for Commodities Online LLC, et al., v. James C. Howard, III, Louis N. Gallo, III, George Saliba, a/k/a George Saliva, and Martin Vegas; Case No. 11-23620-Civ-Cooke/Bandstra*

Based on the analysis performed by the Receiver's forensic accountant and additional deposition and document discovery conducted by the Receiver, the Receiver brought suit against James Howard, Louis Gallo, Martin Vegas, and George Saliba seeking in excess of \$5,000,000.00. All four defendants were principals or involved in the Commodities Online scheme and the Receiver's complaint alleged that all of the defendants converted to their personal use millions of dollars of investor funds.

On January 14, 2013, the Receiver filed an Amended Complaint against the defendants, adding fraudulent transfer claims against defendants Gallo, Saliba and Vegas [D.E. 78, 79].

Defendant Vegas filed an Answer to the Amended Complaint [D.E. 87]. On March 29, 2013, following the Receiver's renewed application, the Clerk of the Court entered a default against Gallo and Saliba [D.E. 92, 93]. On August 29, 2013, Judge Cooke entered a Default Judgment in favor of the Receiver and against Saliba in the amount of \$2,089,368.00, plus prejudgment and postjudgment interest, and attorneys fees [D.E. 105, 106].

Due to the criminal case pending against James Howard and Louis Gallo III (see below at ¶4.a.), the Court entered an order staying the trial of this case, and has held periodic status conferences [D.E. 84, 110, 118]. In addition, the parties have filed status reports [D.E. 120, 121].

3. *David S. Mandel, Receiver for Commodities Online LLC, et al. v. Francisco Javier Ortiz Gonzalez, case no. 12-civ-62471-Dimtrouleas/Snow*

On December 11, 2012, the Receiver filed a lawsuit asserting fraudulent transfer and civil theft claims against Francisco Javier Ortiz Gonzalez. The case was set for trial during the two-week period beginning December 16, 2013 [D.E. 20]. On September 30, 2013, both the Receiver and the Defendant moved for summary judgment [D.E. 39-43]. On October 16, 2013, a mediation was held in this matter and the parties entered a settlement. On November 1, 2013 Judge Dimitrouleas entered an Order approving of the Settlement [D.E. 51].

Defendant Ortiz failed to make any of the payments to the Receiver under the Settlement. On November 18, 2013, Receiver filed a Motion for Entry of Final Judgment Pursuant to the Settlement Agreement, seeking a entry of a judgment in the amount \$200,000 [D.E. 52]. On February 19, 2014, the judge entered an order granting the Receiver's motion and entering a final judgment against Defendant Ortiz in the amount of \$200,000 plus interest [D.E. 54].

4. Related Actions Against Principals of Commodities Online

Separate civil and criminal lawsuits have been filed relating to Commodities Online, against the principals and others who were involved in COL's activities. The Receiver has monitored these matters in his efforts to recoup victim-investor losses.

a. *United States v. James C. Howard, III, et al.*; case no. 12-20630-Cr-Lenard

In September 2012, a federal grand jury in the Southern District of Florida returned a criminal indictment against James C. Howard III, Louis Gallo III, Patricia Saa, Michael Casey and Rita Balbirer, charging the defendants with conspiracy, mail fraud, wire fraud and money laundering in connection with Commodities Online. From approximately January 2010 through April 2011, defendants Howard, Gallo, Saa, Casey and others allegedly conspired to defraud individuals who invested in Commodities Online, LLC, obtaining more than \$20 million from over 700 investors. On September 18, 2013, James C. Howard III pled guilty to conspiracy to commit mail and wire fraud, and subsequently was sentenced to 189 months in prison followed by 3 years of supervised release [D.E. 167, 202].

On August 8, 2014, Louis Gallo III pled guilty to Count I of the indictment [D.E. 384, 385]; his sentencing is set for October 16, 2014. Defendant Balbirer previously pled guilty [D.E. 360], and her sentencing is set for September 23, 2014. Michael Casey, formerly in-house counsel and president of Commodities Online, failed to appear in court and Judge Lenard issued a warrant for his arrest [D.E. 317, 392].

**b. *Securities and Exchange Commission v. James C. Howard, III, et al.*;
Case no. 12-61731-Civ-Zloch**

The Securities and Exchange Commission filed a civil securities fraud action against James C. Howard III, Louis Gallo III and Michael Casey, and several relief defendants, relating to their activities in connection with Commodities Online LLC. In that case, the SEC is seeking injunctive

relief, disgorgement of funds, and monetary penalties. On June 12, 2013, the Court entered a Default Final Judgment against defendant Gallo. On September 13, 2013, the Court granted Michael Casey's motion for a stay of the case pending resolution of the criminal case (see above).

c. *In re James Clark Howard*, case no. 12-28313-JKO, Bankr. S.D. Fla (Chap. 7)

In the James Howard bankruptcy matter, David Mandel, as Receiver, has been listed as a creditor in the amount of \$1,450,000 (based on the Disgorgement Order). See *In re Howard*, case no. 12-28313-JKO, Bankr. S.D. Fla (Chap. 7) [D.E. 13 at 16]. The Receiver has engaged the law firm of Kozyak, Tropin & Throckmorton, P.A. as his bankruptcy counsel. This matter remains pending.

D. Forensic Accounting

1. Cash Management

KapilaMukamal, formerly Kapila & Company, continues to reconcile the Receivership accounts and make necessary deposits and disbursements as directed by the Receiver. The balance in the Receivership account currently totals \$1,928,772.76 and consists of the following:

Turnover of funds from frozen accounts	\$2,434,315.63
Recoveries from March Iron Ore transfers	826,185.15
Settlement proceeds – adversary actions	100,000.00
Other recoveries – legal retainers, miscellaneous	27,213.06
Interest income	<u>476.22</u>
Total Receipts	<u>\$3,388,190.06</u>
Professional fees and expenses	\$1,358,828.23
Receiver's fees and expenses	86,393.85
Federal & state taxes	5,043.09
Other expenses – computer services	<u>9,152.13</u>
Total Disbursements	<u>\$1,459,417.30</u>
Cash Balance as of September 23, 2014	<u>\$1,928,772.76</u>

2. Litigation Support

KapilaMukamal's role continues to focus on providing forensic analysis, support and documentation as requested by the Receiver and his counsel. KapilaMukamal also assisted the US Attorney with computer access and forensic images in connection with their criminal investigation.

3. Tax Services

Kapila Mukamal assists the Receiver in all areas of tax compliance and addresses all tax notices and other requests from the IRS and Department of Revenue.

E. Claims Process

The Receiver has taken steps to prepare for the claims process by organizing the contact information for investors and other claimants. In addition to contact with investors, the Receiver also communicated with and catalogued information from other potential claimants against the Defendants, including but not limited to landlords, vendors, former employees, and other creditors of Defendants.

F. Receiver's Additional Efforts

In addition to the efforts enumerated above regarding marshaling assets, the Receiver and his professionals have performed many services in connection with the Receivership activities, including but not limited to:

- a. closing the related businesses and identifying customers, creditors, and investors;
- b. interviewing employees;
- c. reviewing numerous investor files and attempting to investors;
- d. obtaining and reviewing all financial records to trace fraudulent transfers and other asset diversions;

- e. investigating and attempting to reconstruct the Defendants' financial and operational affairs, despite disorganized and incomplete records;
- f. analyzing potential claims to be pursued on behalf of the Receivership estate;
- g. communicating via email and telephone with investors and creditors;
- h. communicating and coordinating efforts with the SEC;
- i. interviewing creditors and investors of the Defendants;
- j. locating and conducting an inventory of assets belonging to the Defendants;
- k. locating and consolidating Commodities Online's banking accounts into a single interest bearing account;
- l. analyzing account receivables;
- m. reviewing legal authorities on property issues, securities issues, debt collection and receivership issues;
- n. researching transfers of Receivership funds to various entities and individuals, and offshore accounts and activities;
- o. securing the Defendants' computer network from outside access, dismantling and relocating computer equipment;
- p. imaging and analysis of all computer workstations and laptops;
- q. securing and searching all incoming emails;
- r. gaining access to the Defendants' websites and domains;
- s. changing all security passwords for computers, websites and funds transfer software;
- t. revising the Receivership website to provide notice regarding the status of the SEC's action against the Defendants; and

- u. pursuing and monitoring related litigation against the principal owners and operators of Commodities Online and Commodities Online Management.

G. Supplemental Reports

The Receiver will file further reports as his investigation proceeds.

Respectfully submitted,

MANDEL & MANDEL LLP
1200 Alfred I. duPont Building
169 East Flagler Street
Miami, Florida 33131
Telephone: 305.374.7771
Facsimile: 305.374.7776
nsmandel@mandel-law.com

By: */s/ Nina Stillman Mandel*

NINA STILLMAN MANDEL
Florida Bar No.: 843016

E. BARCLAY CALE, P.A.
E. BARCLAY CALE
Florida Bar No.: 829056
169 East Flagler Street
Miami, Florida 33131

Counsel for the Receiver, David S. Mandel

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing was filed by CM/ECF this 23rd day of September, 2014.

/s/ Nina Stillman Mandel